

Council Chamber
Henry L. Brown Municipal Bldg.
One Grand Street
Coldwater, Michigan



May 17, 2021
5:30 p.m.
(517) 279-9501
www.coldwater.org

HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION
ELECTRONIC REGULAR MEETING

The City of Coldwater Historic District Commission will hold an Electronic Special Meeting through Zoom, beginning at **5:30 p.m. on Monday, May 17, 2021**, for purpose of conducting such business that comes before the Historic District Commission. The meeting will take place electronically due to the COVID-19 Pandemic, current rates of infection in Branch County, social distancing requirements and gathering limitations in orders issued under the Public Health Code by Michigan’s Director of Health and Human Services and pursuant to authorization for remote meetings found in Michigan’s Open Meetings Act, MCL 15.263, as amended in Public Act 254 of 2020, authorizing remote meetings pursuant to established procedures in the event of a statewide or local state of emergency or disaster declared pursuant to law, charter, or local ordinance to preserve the personal health or safety of members of the public or the public body and the Coldwater City Council’s declaration of a local state of emergency on March 22, 2021 in Resolution 21-18, which extended the authority for City Boards to conduct remote meetings until August 31, 2021, and the Branch County Board of Commissioners’ December 8, 2020 declaration 2020-09 of a local state of emergency which extended authority to conduct remote meetings until December 31, 2021. For current and up-to-date information regarding the coronavirus, visit: <http://www.Michigan.gov/Coronavirus> or <http://www.CDC.gov/Coronavirus>.

Members of the public may view and participate in the meeting by the following methods:

ELECTRONIC HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION MEETING ACCESS

For individuals who may wish to give public comment, the method for providing public comment during this remote-participation meeting is to call the following toll-free numbers: **1-888-475-4499** or **1-877-853-5257 (Meeting ID: 876 1635 9639)** A Participant ID is not required.

Callers wishing to give public comment may call in before the meeting starts and wait in a “virtual waiting room.” These instructions will be included in every official published agenda of the City Boards. Those calling in will be able to hear the audio of the City Board meeting, but they will be muted until called on. Callers who do not wish to give public comment are encouraged to view the meeting live-streamed on YouTube at, bit.ly/ColdwaterVideo and also on Skitter Channel 61.

ROLL CALL

MEMBERS PRESENT: Member Don Shemel called the meeting to order at 5:30 p.m. with the following members present: Jenny Rakocy, Sarah Zimmer and Flip Johnson. All members noted they were located within the Historic District for this meeting and no email comments were received by members prior to 3:30 p.m. before the meeting.

MEMBERS ABSENT: Tamara Barnes, Tracy Kelley and Chairman Randall Hazelbaker.

COLDWATER CITY HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION MINUTES

May 17, 2021 – 5:30 p.m.

OTHERS PRESENT: Dean Walrack, Susan Heath, Shauna Chávez, Sheila Puffenberger, Chris Caywood, Mike Caywood, Scott Morrison, Don Reid plus one other.

PUBLIC COMMENTS

None.

1. APPROVAL OF MINUTES – April 14, 2021

Commission Action: Motion by Commissioner Sarah Zimmer, seconded by Commissioner Jenny Rakocy, to approve and place on file the April 14, 2021 HDC Regular Minutes, as presented.

Roll Call Vote:

Ayes: Commissioner: Don Shemel, Jenny Rakocy, Sarah Zimmer and Flip Johnson.

Nays: Commissioner: None.

Motion carried.

PROJECT REVIEW

None.

OLD BUSINESS

None.

NEW BUSINESS

2. **HDC21-01** A request by Caywood Propane Gas, Inc. to restore the first-floor commercial front façade, replace 2nd & 3rd floor windows, construct a 2nd & 3rd floor rear balcony, and renovate the rear first-floor commercial façade at the historically contributing structure located at 8 S. Monroe St.

Administrator Dean Walrack presented the background for 8 S. Monroe St. a contributing structure in the Downtown Coldwater Historic District. The building has recently been purchased and has transitioned from a retail use to an office use. The upper floors are proposed for five residential units. The Historic District Inventory lists the building's year of construction at 1900. It is a three-story commercial building. The applicant is intending to operate a sales office from the front commercial space with potential for another commercial unit at the rear of the first-floor. Five residential units are planned for the second and third floors.

COLDWATER CITY HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION MINUTES

May 17, 2021 – 5:30 p.m.

Chapter 1490 of the Codified Ordinances of the City of Coldwater outlines the rules and responsibilities for work within a designated local historic district. In addition, the ordinance sets forth the five public purposes of pursuing historic preservation by the City. They are:

1. Safeguard the heritage of the City of Coldwater
2. Stabilize and improve property values in each district and surrounding areas.
3. Foster civic beauty.
4. Strengthen the local economy.
5. Promote the use of historic districts for the education, pleasure, and welfare of the citizens of the City of Coldwater and of the State of Michigan.

In implementing the five goals outlined above, the commission is tasked with determining whether the proposed awning removal meets the conditions as an alteration to the district from the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation.

In addition to the Secretary of the Interior's Standards, the Commission shall also consider the following per Section 1490.09(b) of the City of Coldwater Historic District Code:

1. The historic or architectural value and significance of the resource and its relationship to the historic value of the surrounding area.
2. The relationship of any architectural features of the resource to the rest of the resource and to the surrounding area.
3. The general compatibility of the design, arrangement, texture, and materials proposed to be used.
4. Other factors, such as aesthetic value, that the Commission finds relevant.
5. Whether the applicant has certified in the application that the property where the work will be undertaken has, or will have before the proposed project completion date, a fire alarm system or a smoke alarm complying with the requirements of the Stille-DeRossettHale Single State Construction Code Act, 1972 PA 230, MCL 125.1501 to 125.1531.

Additionally, per Section 1490.12, a Notice to Proceed may be issued if any of the following conditions are found to prevail:

- a) The resource constitutes a hazard to the safety of the public or to the structure's occupants.
- b) The resource is a deterrent to a major improvement program that will be of substantial benefit to the community and the applicant proposing the work has obtained all necessary planning and zoning approvals, financing, and environmental clearances.
- c) Retaining the resource will cause undue financial hardship to the owner when a governmental action, an act of God, or other events beyond the owner's control created the hardship, and all feasible alternatives to eliminate the financial hardship, which may include offering the resource for sale at its fair market value or moving the resource to a vacant site within the historic district, have been attempted and exhausted by the owner.
- d) Retaining the resource is not in the interest of the majority of the community.

COLDWATER CITY HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION MINUTES

May 17, 2021 – 5:30 p.m.

As outlined by local ordinance and provided for by State law, an appeal of a decision by a local Historic District Commission may be heard by the State Historic Preservation Review Board or to the local circuit court.

STAFF FINDINGS – Staff has reviewed the proposed activities for their relation to the criteria listed in the above sections of this report and has reached the following opinions for consideration of the Historic District Commission.

Secretary of the Interior’s Standards:

Standard 2. The current wooden windows may be original to the building or the product of an early replacement. Replacement window specifications have not been provided, but it should be expected that the exterior appearance will not change.

The rear ground-level facade will be rebuilt to install larger doors and windows in a complementary style to what exists presently, but will make the space usable for a secondary commercial suite. The center third-floor window will be replaced with a door to access the new rear balcony.

Standard 3. The new rear façade elements are meant to share the style of the building’s existing Italianate character.

The rear balcony will be steel and concrete similar to those which have been installed at the Kerr Building (61-63 W. Chicago St.) and proposed for the Purple Orchid (41-47 W. Chicago St.).

Standard 6. The front ground-floor windows will be retained and repaired.

Standards 9 & 10. The rear balcony will not mimic a historic style and will be able to be removed without significantly affecting the structure of the building.

Local Design Review Standards and Guidelines:

Guidelines 1 & 2. S. Monroe St. retains many of its historic buildings and has a relatively strong historic character. Tibbits Plaza is predominantly parking and some of the building rear facades have undergone significant alteration, much of which has no historic characteristic. Steel and concrete decks exist across the plaza at the Kerr Building and another is being installed at the Purple Orchid building. The elements of this project will exist within these contexts.

Guideline 3. The design of the replacement components are meant to be compatible with the design of the building. The addition of the deck is meant to both stand apart from the historic building, but also be consistent with the decks added to other historic buildings throughout the district.

Property owners Chris and Mike Caywood, along with contractor, Scott Morrison, were on hand to answer Commissioner’s questions.

The commission can choose to either approve, deny, or postpone the request for further information.

Commission Action: Motion by Commissioner Sarah Zimmer, seconded by Commissioner Jenny Rakocy, to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness to Caywood Propane Gas, Inc. for the front retail façade restoration, 2nd and 3rd floor replacement windows, 2nd and 3rd floor rear balcony,

COLDWATER CITY HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION MINUTES

May 17, 2021 – 5:30 p.m.

and rear commercial façade at the contributing commercial structure located at 8 S. Monroe St., as it aligns with all the criteria as laid out in the City of Coldwater Historic District Code, as presented.

Roll Call Vote:

Ayes: Commissioner: Jenny Rakocy, Sarah Zimmer, Flip Johnson and Don Shemel.

Nays: Commissioner: None.

Motion carried.

PUBLIC COMMENTS

None.

ADJOURNMENT – Next meeting Wednesday, June 9, 2021.

There being no further business to come before the Historic District Commission, Member Don Shemel declared the meeting adjourned at 5:51 p.m.



Shauna Chávez
Deputy City Clerk